Women's Rights and Democratic Transitions: A Comparative Study of Pakistan, Chile, and South Africa

Abida Bano[·]

https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3918-5981

Abstract

Democratization provides women an opportunity to represent their interests/issues effectively. Institutional change of democratic transition proves women's movement's best chance to push for gender-sensitive policy outcomes. This case study critically examines three selected democratic transitions' workings and assesses the cross-cases variation in women's gendered outcomes (South Africa, Chile, and Pakistan). The research questions state as "how and why did women's movements perform differently in achieving gendered policy outcomes in the democratic transitions?" Engaging comparative framework and the qualitative approach, the study shows that the socio-political context, historical legacies, and party alliances have played vital role in varying gendered outcomes.

Key words: Women's movement, Gendered outcomes, democratization, Collective action, Pakistan, Chile, South Africa.

Introduction

The democratization boom in the 1980s (Third Wave)[1] gave all the society's segments a chance to change their political lot in the institutional arrangement. In the wake of democratic transitions, the marginalized and excluded groups articulated their interests and strived to realize the policy outcomes. It also was a moment where an incremental change in the institutions put all the bargaining elements on the table to plead their case, mobilize, and make alliances to gain success. The scholars on institutions (Goodin, North,

[·] Abida Bano is an Assistant Professor at the Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Peshawar, Pakistan. Email: abidabano@uop.edu.pk

Dryzek) believe that incremental changes in the existing institutions are a better option, whereas introducing new institutions is cumbersome and costly. In addition, scholars note that democratic transitions are the moments of flux where stakeholders try to maximize their benefit. Several democratic transitions made a remarkable political development in the history of representation.

The literature puts forward a consensus upon the moment of progression of the state from dictatorship to a representative government as the democratic transition. Approximately 60 authoritarian regimes from Europe, Latin America, Asia, and Africa transitioned to democracies in the late 1980s – one of the most significant political developments of the late 20th century (Huntington 1999). By the end of 1998, around 117 authoritarian regimes in Eastern Europe, Southern Europe, Latin America, and Asia had transitioned to democratic systems (Waylen 2010). Despite fragility and novice political systems, contemporary democracies provided an opportunity to live in democratic regimes (Bunce 2000). One of democratization's intended goals is to allow marginalized and excluded groups to represent their interests in the decision-making. The democratic transition of authoritarian regimes into democracies opened up arenas of contestation and political struggles for women's movement and civil society.

Democratization does not solve gender issues per se, but it provides an opportunity by creating spaces for all, including the women's movement, to articulate and present their interests for policy outcomes. The women's movement has played a crucial role in the women's rights struggle in the newly transitioned democracies worldwide. Women's activism mobilized several actors to topple authoritarian rules and alliances with the political parties to realize women's rights agenda in contemporary democracies. The democratic transitions in the 1980 and 1990s present substantial evidence of women's movements' ability and struggle to secure legislative outcomes such as gender quotas and laws to improve women's lives. Democratic transitions typically result in gendered outcomes, especially when women groups could successfully avail this opportunity and push forward a feminist agenda in the new institutional settings. Women have mobilized in almost every country for their rights, but the success rate varies (Htun and Weldon 2012). However, the interaction between the actors during

transition determines democracy later (Waylen 2003). Thus, variation between the women's movements' performance in democratic transitions is possible and plausible.

Some scholars believe that democratic transitions create gender-equal institutions (Gelb and Hart 1999; Gordon 1994; Seidman 1999). However, the literature on democratization does not pay adequate attention to women's movements during democratic transitions, which is a gap in the scholarship. The scholarship barely talks about gender concerning democratic transitions. The omission of gender as a relevant category in the transition politics has resulted in the analytical inaptness in understanding the women's movement's role and activism in democratization. Waylen (2010 & 1994) is very vocal and critical about the scarcity of literature on the heterogeneity of the women's movement in democratic transitions and subsequent gender relations in the post-transition period. Thus, this paper asks the research questions as, "how and why did women's movements perform differently in the democratic transitions in the different contexts? More specifically, whether they could achieve any gendered policy outcomes (gender quotas and pro-women laws) for women in the transition politics?" The study's purpose is to assess whether women's movements could use the opportunity presented by democratic transitions to achieve gendered outcomes in Chile, South Africa, and Pakistan.

Operationalizing Key Concepts Used

This paper uses O'Donnell and Schmitter's conceptualizing of the democratic transition, which calls "an interval between one political regime and another" as regime transition (1986; 6). Scholars state that democratic transitions entail two simultaneous yet independent processes – the dissolution of the old authoritarian regime and the emergence of democratic institutions (Prezeworski 1989; Welsh 1994). The democratic transitions followed different modes like abrupt, pacted among others. The pacted transition is defined as "a process of peaceful transition from authoritarian rule to democracy involving negotiations between the incumbent and stakeholders – opposition group" (Guo & Stradiotto, 2014; 5). In the present study, all the selected cases followed the pact path for transitioning to democracy. All the three selected democratic transitions were pacted transitions in which all the stakeholders could negotiate and bargain for their interests. Thus, the pacted transition is a stepwise transition

to democracy wherein liberalization coupled with democratization occurs in the authoritarian regime and gradually replaces authoritarian rules.

Moreover, the study operationalizes the gendered outcomes as policy outcomes such as gender quotas and women-friendly laws to measure the women's movement's success/effectiveness. This paper engages a comparative theoretical framework and uses secondary qualitative data analysis to answer the research questions. Besides, it includes a systematic review of the literature on the women's movement in each case to compare and contrast the cases. In the following sections, the critical analysis of important themes presents an exact comparison of the women's movement's strengths and weaknesses in individual cases. This article contributes to several strands of the literature, such as the women's movement, democratization, and women's representation. It is worth noting that the paper does not engage historical evolution and development of women's movement in each case in detail; instead, it evaluates its performance in the pre-transition period[2] and during the transition moment for analysis.

Case Study Research Design – Why most different cases?

The comparative case study of the women's movement in Chile, South Africa, and Pakistan provides a rich understanding of diverse contexts with various social, political, and historical realities. The choice of case study to investigate the research question is made on the logic of appropriateness. The role of theory is vital in the case study research wherein cases' selection is based on either supporting theoretical orientation or description of the phenomenon (Levy 2008). Moreover, the case study offers a detailed description of the case under study. Scholars argue that researchers could pragmatically select the cases based on resources, time, access, and purpose (Searight and Gerring 2008). However, they suggest selecting a case study on the independent variable to minimize the selection bias. The present study engages the mentioned scholars and uses purposive sampling to select the cases of democratic transition. The study design is the most different case research design, one of the types of case study research design. The three selected democratic transitions are the most different in history, politics, and context, making them worthwhile to compare (Gerring 20). Searight & Gerring (2008) argue that most different cases

selection in the case study research design are one way to show the co-variation between the independent variable and dependent variable while other factors show different values. Moreover, in most cases of research design, cases are similar in two fundamental ways: key independent variable and the outcome.

In the present study, the selected cases show distinct characteristics and yet underwent a democratic transition, whereas the women's movement played its role in supporting women's rights in the transitions. Historically, Chile has been under the strong influence of the Catholic Church. Due to conservative culture and Church's influence, women had not become a part of public life and remained restricted to their gender identities and gender roles (Toppin 2018). Thus, politics and religion worked in sync to define women's status in Chilean society. On the other hand, South Africa has a distinct historical legacy of racial discrimination that was equally suppressive for non-White men and women. The oppressive Apartheid regime that the National Party implemented in 1948 wreak havoc on non-White families wherein men were sent to the work areas, women and children were not allowed. As a result, women would be left behind to look after families, children, and extended families while lacking any financial support. Thus, in the face of discrimination and injustices, the anti-Apartheid movement got momentum, which later was joined by the women's movement (Lenser 2019).

Lastly, history, culture, religion play a key role in determining women's status in Pakistan. Women are mainly identified with the gender roles and identities valorized and sanctified by culture and religion. Hence, women's activism and the women's movement is mobilizing date back to the 1980s when General Zia ul Haq severely dented women's fundamental rights by implementing the controversial and discriminatory Hudood Ordinance. Since there were almost no women in decision-making to contest the controversial ordinance, women's groups and civil society took it upon themselves to organize agitation against the discriminatory law. Since then, the women's movement has been navigating contentious Pakistani politics to struggle for women's rights. In this paper, the democratic transition from General Musharraf's regime to democracy will be compared with Chile and South Africa to evaluate

the results of women's movements in the shape of gendered outcomes.

What makes the three selected cases exciting pick is the diversity or least likeliness which shall bring to fore that despite the diversity of context, culture, and politics, women's s movement could navigate the muddy waters of democratic transition and gain gendered outcomes. Some cases are indeed more successful than others. The most different cases research design will help explore each case's context and describe the significant events.

Theoretical Perspectives

Democracy brings inclusion and represents a plurality of interests and discourses in the political arena that, in turn, minimizes the political exclusions. It is important to note that democracy is not a monolithic concept. The scholars have defined it in diverse ways; hence, it seems complicated to develop one universal definition of democracy. Acknowledging the variety in conceptualizing democracy, Lawson (1993) rightly notes that 'democratization has a problem of "fuzzy concepts"[3] (p. 183).' Nevertheless, the minimalist definition can be called 'a minimum consensus' or criterion for calling a regime a democracy, whereas a minimalist democracy must have passed through a transition moment – free and fair elections. Aside from free and fair elections, democracy passes through several phases to reach its maturity – consolidation. For example, Linz and Stepan (1996) presented a more comprehensive framework for a consolidated democracy in their seminal work Problems of Consolidation. They argue that a consolidated democratic regime has five vibrant and robust arenas – civil society, political society, bureaucracy, economic society, and law rule (p. 9). Hence, a consolidated democracy refers to a political system 'where democracy becomes the only game in town' (Linz & Stepan 1996; p. 5).

Democracy thrives on all stakeholders' vibrant political participation, including historically marginalized and excluded groups. The participatory theory of democracy (Carole Pateman) makes a strong case for women and excluded groups for more participation and inclusion in decision-making. Simialry, Young (2002) argues that democratic equality entails representing all those affected by the outcome of decision-making. She favors group representation in the decision-making. The women's movement,

representing women's interests, is a legitimate stakeholder in the struggle for women's rights in democratic systems. As mentioned earlier, a vigilant civil society is a salient feature of democracies, which plays a crucial role in toppling authoritarian regimes and securing the people's rights.

Theoretically, the women's movement is not a unified and homogenous phenomenon; instead, it is complex and heterogenous, encompassing many interests. Scholars argue that the women's movement organizes and mobilizes women's interests in a particular context (Boldt and White 2011, p. 29). The literature on social movements records that women's identities shape their interests, which mobilize them for collective action. Moreover, framing women's social movements by appealing to gender identities attracts women of various backgrounds and economic interests to gather at one platform for concerted political action (Baldez 2002). Waylen (1992) holds that collective identity and collective action frames often empowered the women who were victims of repression to organize, mobilize, and take action (301). More specifically, women's movements engage in political action (in democratic regimes) to achieve women's political and economic rights (Boldt and White 2011: 30).

However, the scholarship on democratization shows that women gained minimal democratic transitions (Waylen 2010; Roman 2001; Rai 1996; Waylen 1994; Watson 1993). The present study concurs with the earlier studies arguing that democratization did not benefit women as much as expected. However, it is also true that in multiple cases, women's movements pursued women's rights successfully in the transition politics and pursued the state for gendered outcomes. The present comparative case study adds to the understanding of women's movements in varied contexts of democratic transitions and their ability to secure women's rights in the institutional setup.

Viterna and Fallon (2008) use four theoretical factors – historical legacies of women's movement, context, political parties, and external influence to evaluate the variation in the gendered outcomes of democratic transitions in Argentina, El Salvador, Ghana, and South Africa. However, the lack of case studies in women's movements' performance in the various democratic transitions' contexts asks for further investigation of the issue. Hence, this paper, drawing on Viterna and Fallon, uses three relevant theoretical

factors – historical and cultural context, women's movement legacies, and party alliances to assess the women's movements' gendered outcomes in the transition to democracy in Chile, South Africa, and Pakistan. The selected cases differ in historical and cultural contexts, ideological and political party structures, while the transition path is similar – pacted democratic transition.

Democratic Transition in Chile – Church politics, and women's movement

The Chilean women's movement took drastic turns over time. For the first time, women mobilized against President Allende in the 1970s and opposed a socialist regime, thus rejected the socialist regime and welcomed military rule. Ironically, however, women groups participated actively and fervently to topple the military rule when it did not fulfill the masses' expectations. These two are highly opposite political positions and pose several questions about the stability of the women's s movement's stance in the Chilean context. The women's movement is an independent actor whose agenda in Chilean politics is difficult to take. The studies show that it emerged and worked diligently during the struggles for democracy but could not institutionalize women's rights in the democratic regimes and fade quickly (Caivano and Hardwick 2008; Waylen 1993). The present paper considers the role of the women's movement in securing women's rights in the democratic transition of Pinochet's right-wing authoritarian military regime that ruled Chile for 17 years (1973 – 1990).

Historically, Chilean women were mainly associated with and engaged in traditional roles, whereas men remained a dominant force in the public sphere. Thus, the role of women had been marginalized in Chilean politics. In Chile, women's rights are deeply influenced by Catholic Church doctrine. Though the Church's stance has changed over time, it seldom considers women's concerns and demands. Thus, Chilean women have a formidable force – Catholic Church to determine their culture and political status. Scholars argue that feminism impacted Chilean women and changed their conditions considerably (Tobar 2003). The Chilean women have come out of the shadows and participate in the public sphere for more than four decades (Lesner 2019).

Military rule and suppression – An impetus for women's mobilizing

The military rule that the women have welcomed so passionately soon engaged in oppressing the political opponents. In a short amount of time, the military regime brutalized thousands and imprisoned many to suppress the opposition. The women engaged in collective action against the neo-liberal economic policies and political oppression of Pinochet's rule (Boldt and White 2011). Women emerged as a dominant group to protest against repressive measures of the almost closure of political spaces and demobilizing traditional political actors by military rule (Caivano and Hardwick 2008: 266). Repression of unions and political party leaders, women, availed the opportunity to emerge as a force to fill in the vacuum left by men as they were the primary victims of repression (Caivano and Hardwick: 267). Women's groups organized demonstrations against economic and political repression, and this was when women became visible in the country's politics. Women's movement participated vigorously in demonstrations against Pinochet's rule and faced the consequences. The return of democracy to Chile and Pinochet's withdrawal from power provided an opportunity for emancipatory movements and civil society to push for gender-sensitive policies and strengthen women's citizenship (Guzman, Seibert, and Staab 2010: 971).

Baldez (2002) argues that before Pinochet's coup in 1973, Chile's political, institutional order was much more moderate due to a reasonable presidential system, characterized by two contradictory trends. On the one hand, the electoral system for congressional elections would foster ideological solid political parties, and coalitions would be required to control influential executives, on the other (Baldez 2002; 9). In this scenario, political alliances and realignments were a common practice in the Chilean political context and a tricky matter at the same time. The political parties adhering to different ideologies would find it hard to keep coalitions intact and broaden their party base. Thus, political realignments and alliances were not unusual in the Chilean context. Political alliances and realignments are crucial to the women's movement's plight because they provided vital assistance to the women's groups to organize their particular interests and mobilize for achieving their agenda.

Women's movements' demands and party alliances

Given Chile's conservative and religious society, political parties did not care for women's movement activism; however, they rationally

co-opted them to help topple the military regime. Thus, the only shared cause that brought them together for a short while was to send away the military regime home. During Chile's transition to democracy, Women For Life-MPLV – a forum that the opposition parties (The Democratic Alliance – AD and Popular Democratic Alliance – MDP, galvanized such as The Democratic Alliance (AD) and Popular Democratic Movement (MDP) united and mobilized women to present gender outcomes for policy (Baldez 2002: 156).

These women groups were compelled to make alliances with political parties at the risk of extinction from the political arena. Before 1973, the political elite would assert defining gender roles for women and men in private and public terms, but now they realized that during the plebiscite in 1988, women's vote was crucial to defeating Pinochet. Unfortunately, the ideological parties did not care for women's political mobilizing and demands but used them only as a catalyst to oust military rule. Nonetheless, women's mobilizing against Pinochet's regime proved that the women's movement is a vital political force in shaping the country's future. Also, coming out of the shadows and sharing the political arena with the political forces show that the women's movement could contest and firmly forward women's interests.

The Chilean government created a body named SERNAM[4] composed of feminists from Socialists and Democrats, which was directly responsible to the President regarding evaluation, coordination, and policies on women's issues. Henceforth, women were not entirely out from the political arena (Waylen 1993; 581). Coversely, Baldz (2002) emphasizes that there were fewer laws to promote gender equity, which means that the women's movement could not gain much from the party alliances they made. With the return of democracy, the Catholic Church asserted its conservative role through active ideological parties' coalitions with leftist and centrist political parties. These coalitions and conservative male political elite stressed the traditional gender roles of men and women. These confrontations between conservative and progressive elements of gender-sensitive legislation continued for twenty years (Guzman, Seibert, and Staab 2010; 971). Ironically, these political alliances tended to keep women's issues such as sexual reproductive rights, abortion, divorce legislation, and sex education off their

agenda, and as a result, abortion is still illegal in Chile (Guzman et al., 2010).

Democratization in the Chilean case was limited. Thus democracy and party politics returned later with presidential elections for Patricio Aylwin in 1990, who contacted women's groups to incorporate women's interests into policy outcomes (Boldt and White; 38). Nevertheless, there seems no significant legislation regarding women's issues during Aylwin; the political elite once again started asserting that women should resume traditional gender roles. Women's movement could not hold the political spaces in the wake of democratic institutionalization in a meaningful way that they gained during the authoritarian regime due to dominant male political figures (Franceschet 2005). In the early 1990s, only five percent (5%) of women became part of the Parliament, which cannot be called a vital outcome that they owed to democracy (Waylen 1993: 579).

Post democratic transition – A push and pull for women's struggle for rights

The women's representation in politics after the democratic transition in the 1990s was not impressive till 2015. For example, women filled 17 seats out of 120 in the lower house, which is 14.2%, whereas, in the Senate, the number of women is 5 out of 38 places, 13.2% of the total seats (IPU 2013). The former Chilean President Michelle Bachelet introduced a bill stated as 'equal political participation of women and men,' called Quota Law, in 2007. This bill did not progress in Parliament. Despite its highest GDP and HDI among the South American countries, Chile is the last one that adopted a gender quota law in 2015, which obligates political parties not to exceed 60% of male or female candidates for senator or deputy (Schwindt-Bayer 2015).

The Chilean women's movement in the post-democratic transition period did not vanish in thin air. However, it did not succeed to a more considerable extent, either. Conservative political elite and alliances made their access to decision-making difficult. SERNAM and the Left political struggle with conservative elements for more women's participation and gender-specific legislation. Alliances proved detrimental to the political opportunity of the women's movement in Chile's context, and the struggle is still on. Tarrow (1994) argues that cycles of protest mobilize for collective

action in the social movements until the state represses, reforms, or overthrows in a revolution (155). Thus, the women's protest and activism entered into a new phase after the democratic transition in Chile. The women's movement credits the mixed bag of success and weaknesses to the conservative socio-political context, short-term and unfounded alliances with right-wing political parties, and Church politics. Despite that, the women's movement could not gain gendered outcomes identified in the study but set the future course of women's activism.

The re-emergence of the women's movement against Pinochet's regime demonstrates that party alliances played a crucial role in mobilizing women's movement by reminding them of their role in toppling Allende's socialist regime in the 1970s. Similarly, their gender identities (mother, sisters) and roles have been the women's movement's frames in transition politics. The Chilean' s context is adamant about pushing women to associate with gender roles and Christian values restrictive of their public role. Due to integration and alliances, it had to compromise some of its agenda points due to a lack of other available options. Many women mobilized and empowered those who were earlier engaged in the private sphere in Chilean society. However, after the democratic transition, the women's movement chose to integrate and remained autonomous. Conservative male political elite and Catholic Church pushed women to their gender roles to a more significant extent. However, Michelle Bachelet's election was a fresh breeze and new hope for women in the Chilean context. Though the women's movement in Chile could not succeed in legislative outcomes and gender quota immediately after the democratic transition, it seems to have changed public perception and popular discourses regarding gender roles, which is evident in Michelle Bachelet's success as President twice.

Although the women's movement in democratic Chile was scaled back to some extent, feminist activists continued presenting their demands for gender outcomes. Thus, women's interests were incorporated into the public agenda (Boldt and White 2011). From the mid-1990s, different actors within and outside the state worked for more progressive and liberal policy, which was supported by the socialist leadership of Ricardo Lagos (2000-2006) and Michelle Bachelet (2006-2010) (Guzman, Seibert, and Staab 2010: 972). However, in contemporary Chile, the Catholic Church and its agenda

and conservative political elite are not in tune with public and popular discourses. Moreover, progressive legislation such as a change in divorce laws had been delayed for 14 years. Until 2004 when a restrictive law was passed and approved the divorce law (972).

Women's rights in South Africa's Transition to Democracy

The South African democratic transition case presents an excellent example of women's activism, which ameliorates women's role in toppling the authoritarian apartheid regime and institutionalizing gendered outcomes. Waylen (2007) makes a strong case for the South African women's movement for its capacity to organize, mobilize women, and engage in collective action in the transition to democracy. Unlike the Latin American case - Chile, South Africa presents strong evidence for women's movements' success in articulating and achieving gendered outcomes in democratic transition. It clearly shows that women's mobilizing played a vital role in the anti-apartheid movement, put forward women's demands and interests to the new institutional setup, and succeeded in formalizing gender quotas in politics and pro-women legislation.

Gendered Society and Gender Roles

The apartheid regime (a racial system) was created in 1948 and was significantly different from other authoritarian regimes due to its open support and salience for 'race' as a dominant factor. According to Wood (2000), a White minority in the South African apartheid regime was privileged at the Black majority's expense, of which, Black women were even worse due to double discrimination as Black and women. The National Party (NP) ruled the country until 1994, and in the White-only Parliament, there was no significant opposition at all (Waylen 2007). The apartheid regime's effects on different groups were different because they did not pursue one policy towards all. In general, women as a category faced discrimination and suppression during the apartheid regime. However, race as a variable played differently for White and non-White women. White women were discriminated against by White men but in a privileged position compared to Black men and women.

Racial discrimination was pervasive entailing social, political, economic, and legal aspects. White women were given the right to vote over other women, but abortion was still restricted to them, and no effective law on domestic violence placed them lower on gender

hierarchy during the apartheid regime. The authoritarian apartheid regime supported stereotypical gender relations and conservative relations that presented White women as mothers. As motherhood was valorized for White women, women of color never got any advantage of being mothers or other gender roles. Paradoxically, Black women were alienated, suppressed, and marginalized based on their color. Black women and children were also never treated as a unified category (Waylen 2007; 527). Hence, the apartheid regime was suppressive and discriminatory concerning race and gender and full of self-contradictory notions.

Historical Legacy, Context and Party Alliances

South African women started organizing, mobilizing, and articulating their interests long before the democratic transition, but the overwhelming academic interest in the anti-apartheid movement has overshadowed women's mobilizing to a great extent. Women's Charter in 1950, centered around Congress Alliance and Freedom charter is an excellent example in this regard. Moreover, African National Congress (ANC) – a multi-racial liberation movement, played a vital role in realizing more women's representation in ANC to carve out a clear goal for women and feminism in coming times. The apartheid regimes' biased approach compelled the women's movement to emerge as a unified force in opposition to racial and gender discrimination (Waylen 2010).

In the 1980s, women started organizing as a self-conscious group, and a vibrant Black Rural Women's Movement emerged that mobilized poor women against the apartheid regime. However, they did not use the term 'feminism' for various reasons. One of them was the conservative characterizing of women in societal discourses. For example, women were identified as mothers and nurturers primarily who belonged to households. Association and labeling with feminism would have been detrimental to the cause of the Black Rural women's movement and would adversely affect its appeal to the general masses. Thus, political correctness and masses appeal were clever policies of the Black Rural women's movement in the conservative political and social context of South Africa. The appropriate and culturally resonant framing of women's mobilization earned them influential political allies and public support for meaningful outcomes. Zald (1996) defines frames as "... the specific metaphors, symbolic interpretations, and cognitive cues

used to render or cast behavior and events in an evaluative mode and to suggest alternative modes of action" (262). Bedford and Snow (2000) argue that cultural frames are beliefs and ideas that motivate people and legitimize collective behavior (614).

The democratic transition in South Africa was a pact between the National Party, the ANC, and Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) (Inmann 2013; 2). Thus, the pacted democratic transition presented all stakeholders and groups to negotiate their interests and agenda – a perfect moment for women to present their demands. In the wake of the realization of ANC's internal weaknesses and lack of a unified representative body of women's movement, the Women National Coalition (WNC) was formed to present a coherent agenda to secure women's interests in the new democratic regime (Waylen 2010). At Malibongwe Conference in 1990, women's specific policy demands were presented: the state's women machinery and more political representation of South African women (339). WNC did an outstanding job of facilitating a triple alliance of key women, academics, activists, and feminists (Cock 1997).

Women's movement mobilized resources from the platform of WNC to organize women for collective action. Additionally, it helped get women and organized them into negotiating teams with various political party caucuses, and as a result of these efforts, a commitment to establishing a Commission for Gender Equality was part of the interim constitution (Waylen 2010; 341). Before the 1994 democratic elections, the apartheid regime passed several laws: the 1993 Prevention of Family Violence Act, repealing discriminatory laws and replacing it with the 1993 General Law Fourth Amendment Act, and signed CEDAW, among others (Walsh, 2012). Some more significant developments of the women's movement during the democratic transition of South Africa are to mainstream gender in Reconstruction and Development Progam (RDP) and ANC's promise to allocate a 30% gender quota for upcoming multi-racial elections (Waylen; 341).

Achievements of Women's Movement

Unlike Chile, the women's movement in the South African democratic transition achieved remarkable gendered outcomes and proved a great success for women's interests during and post-transition. In the legislative arena, women filled 27.7% of parliamentary seats due to the first non-racial elections. Moreover,

many women joined the executive and were made deputy ministers in the first Parliament and more in the next Parliament (Waylen 2010; 342). ANC was organized inside Parliament and collaborated with the Parliamentary Women's Committee (PWC) and Joint Standing Committee on Quality of Life and Women's Status (JSCIQLSW). According to Waylen (2010), women are represented in the legislative, bureaucratic, and constitutional arena in a considerable number and meaningful manner (344). On a policy level, legislation on domestic violence was made in 1998, a joint venture of feminists, ANC, PWC, and JSCIQLSW (Waylen; 345). Another pro-women landmark law named the Termination of Pregnancy Act was passed in 1996, which states that abortion is no more illegal but available in the first twelve weeks of pregnancy (346).

More specifically, South African Women's movement made alliances with opposition groups, which paved the way for a better presentation of gender policy outcomes during and after the democratic transition. Additionally, they consciously and carefully used 'human rights and gender equality' frames that attracted political parties to extend their support for sharing common grounds. Their sensitive cultural framing of women's issues before the democratic transition helped them become more progressive after the democratic transition. The factors of historical legacies, social context, and alliances played a vital role in the South African women's movement's successful gendered outcomes. Women of color's power and agency and their meticulousness with choosing cultural frames show women's political awakening against the suppressive and racially discriminatory regime.

South African women's movement presents one of the most successful cases for the women's movement's ability to achieve gender outcomes during and after the democratic transition. In contrast, the Chilean women's movement did not succeed in gaining long-term institutional outcomes for women, which is why it faded quickly. As Hutn (2003) argues, alliances between the political elite and religious or tribal leaders are detrimental to the gender reform agenda since it threatens their core principles. In Chile, aligning with the Church politics, the leading party did not favor abortion or divorce under the fear of losing critical allies.

Democratic Transition in Pakistan and Gendered Outcomes

According to Waylen (1994), women cannot expect a lot from democratic transitions, and responsibility goes to women's organizations that show a lack of vigor and interest once the regular political activity is resumed (352-53). The women's rights struggle in Pakistan is a joint endeavor of the women's groups, civil society, and media. Pakistan is a signatory to the CEDAW,[5] SDGs,[6] and MDGs[7] today. However, the change did not come easy, and there is still a long way to gender equality in the public sphere. In response to making political institutions gender-balanced and gender-friendly, the women's movement and civil society have facilitated the change in exclusive male stream Pakistani politics in collaboration with the media. In the 73 years of Pakistan's political history, there have been times when no single woman would make a part of the national Parliament (Zia era - the 1980s). As a result, women's groups (WAF),[8] civil society, and women's movement spearheaded the struggle for men and women's political equality and challenged the discriminatory attitude of denying women their rightful place in decision-making since the 1980s.

Contextual Politics and Military's Role

The women's movement has been on the national political scene since the 1980s when it loudly agitated against the military rule of General Zia ul Haq (1977-88) (Shaheed, 2010). In hindsight, various political parties (liberal and conservative) started to pay attention to the women's movement as a legitimate political actor and started incorporating women's issues in their manifestos. Women's movement against Zia's regime was reactive but changed its course to a more deliberative mode in the 1990s. It is also true that the government of Pakistan has made several international commitments on gender equality since the Beijing conference in 1995 that motivated them to institute progressive and liberal pro-women legislation with time.

Pakistani political system has evolved, whereas domestic and international factors contributed to these changes over time. For example, institutionalizing gender quotas is one of those salient and progressive political developments. However, gender quotas have always been there with the term 'reserved seats' in all Pakistan's constitutions (1956, 1962, and 1973), with awful low representation ranging from 5-10% seats in the national Parliament. In 2002, Pakistan's government adopted 33% of gender quotas at the local

government's level and 17% at the national level, a landmark development in Pakistani women's political lives (Reyes 2002). Scholars argue that institutions' presence makes certain things more natural to do and others harder (Goodin 1996; 6). Thus, the allocation of gender quotas in Pakistan enabled women to participate in mainstream politics, which is also one of the international commitments (women's empowerment) made by Pakistan's government.

General Pervez Musharraf's military rule that began with a coup in 1999 got weakened due to internal social movements such as lawyer's movement and deadlock among various organs of government due to his unlawful (unconstitutional) holding of two offices of Chief of Pakistan Army and President of Pakistan at the same time. He held elections in 2002 on a non-party basis, and the elected Parliament remained in power until 2008, with Musharraf as the President of the country. Under the civil society's tremendous pressure, the media, and the international community, he promised to hold general elections on January 8, 2008. However, during the campaign for elections in 2008, the former prime minister of Pakistan, Benazir Bhutto got assassinated, and general elections were delayed until February 18, 2008.

Civil Society, Women's Mobilizing and Gender Quotas

Musharraf's government (2000-2008) was instrumental in the introduction of gender quotas. However, civil society played an essential role in advocacy and lobbying for it. As a result of the adoption of gender quotas, women's representatives participated in the local government's decision-making in Pakistan as women councilors under Local Government Ordinance 2000. However, 33% of gender quotas at the local level were not extended to the national and provincial levels subsequently. After lengthy debates, National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) announced allocating 17% seats for women in the national assembly and 18% in the Senate, and a joint electorate was adopted to fill these positions (Reyes 2002). The significant support for large quota allocation came from women's organizations and women's groups, which allowed the media to participate in mobilization and lobbying. Musharraf's regime, relying on the 'enlightened moderation' principle, organized around a relatively liberal agenda regarding women's rights. Besides, the gender quotas proved a catalyst for achieving positive discrimination

for women and 'institutional irritant' in Goodin's words (1996). The women parliamentarians are trying to build consensus among their respective political parties on demanding at least a 10% gender quota for women on general seats (Haroon 2011).

In Pakistan, women's groups and NGOs were organized around women's interests even before the democratic transition. The media supported women's movements' framing of women's issues (metaphors, symbols, and language) regarding spreading it for broader appeal. According to Zald (1996), cultural frames can influence cultural stock, which seems plausible in Pakistan's women's movement. The primary purpose of frames (diagnostic) is to locate/diagnose injustices and grievances in a particular segment of society, articulate them and suggest prognostic frames to address these injustices; later frames layout ways, means, and measures (alternative course of action) to address these grievances (Benford and Snow 2000). Cultural frames, being able to drive collective action, affect the cultural stock in a long-lasting way, as Zald (1996) explained.

The credit of achieving 33% of gender quotas in the local government also goes to the untiring efforts of the women's movement[9] in Pakistan. Women's organizations such as Women Action Forum (WAF), Shirkat Gah, Aurat Foundations, ASAR, and others have been engaged in advocacy for gender quotas for a long time. The media also played its role in rallying with the women's groups and women's MPs during the 2000s to expedite gender quotas in national and local politics. Moreover, international NGOs and organizations such as USAID, GTZ, and UN Women provide financial and moral support to women's groups and NGOs to achieve gender outcomes at the national level. However, NGOs' negative image proves detrimental to the women's movement's capacity to organize and advocate for women's interests across the country. International NGOs are perceived as an agent of westernization in the conservative society of Pakistan. Notably, the recent wave of religious extremism and militancy in the country poses a substantial threat to the cause of the women's movement.

Post Democratic Transition Women's Movement

The democratic transition paved the way for furthering democratic processes in the country. Thus, in the wake of the February 2008 elections, women filled 77 seats out of 342 in the national assembly.

It made 22.5% of the national assembly's total seats (lower house) at the time. Furthermore, women filled 17 seats out of 104 seats in the Senate (upper house). Thus, women's seats are 16.3% of the total seats in the national Parliament (2008-2012) of Pakistan (Inter-Parliamentary Union – IPU 2012). On a policy level, Parliament (2008-2012) was successful in bringing some progressive legislation regarding women's issues as gender outcomes (legislative) of women's movement that is a collective impact of gender quotas (women members of Parliament, women's groups, and NGOs) and women's movement.

The series of progressive legislation regarding women's issues is evidence of the long-term fruits of democratic transition in Pakistan. In 2012, a bill related to the National Commission on Status of Women (NCSW) was passed by the PPP's government, which empowers NCSW financially and administratively to investigate violence issues against women and bring up more meaningful measures to address crimes against women (UN WOMEN 2012). On the other hand, 'The Prevention of Anti-Women Practices (Criminal Amendment) Bill 2010', authored by Dr. Donya Aziz (Member of National Assembly from PML-Q), remained stuck in the National Assembly for three years (The Dawn Daily 2011). Notwithstanding the delaying tactics, such laws' passing proves that democratic arrangement provides women a platform to make their voices heard. The Protection against Sexual Harassment of Women at the Workplace Bill 2010 and Amendment in Pakistan Penal Code 1860 (Act XLV of 1860) and the Code of Criminal Procedure 1898 (Act V of 1898) Section 509 became a part of the national law in 2011. The main factor behind passing the Sexual Harassment bill is an AASHA alliance (Alliance Against Sexual Harassment). This alliance against sexual harassment at the workplace was formed by five organizations working on women's issues and the Pakistan Institute of Labor Education and Research. This alliance started working on bills mentioned above in 2001 and get them passed in 2010 finally.

In a similar vein of pro-women legislation in 2011, MNA Marvi Memon, MNA Begum Shahnaz Sheikh, and MNA Dr. Anusha Rehman introduced this bill to grow acid crimes against women in the country. Thus, the national Parliament passed the Acid Control and Acid Prevention Bill 2008, which became federal law. However, the bill on domestic violence remained stuck in Parliament for a few

years due to vehement opposition from JUI (F). Later, the domestic violence bill was passed for twin cities – Islamabad and Rawalpindi. According to Alvarez (19889), women's representatives, and women's organizations' role is crucial in democratic transitions and consolidation. However, she is skeptical about the role of the women's movement in the post-transition period in the Latin American context. In other words, she argues that women's movements lose their vigor in post-transition and lack the agency to organize and achieve meaningful gender outcomes at the policy level. However, it is not valid for the women's movement in South Africa and Pakistan, who are engaged in collective action to push the boundaries of conservative structures after the democratic transitions.

Conclusions

The women's movement played a vital role in achieving gendered outcomes – gender quotas and pro-women laws, in democratic transitions in South Africa and Pakistan. The regime transition is a moment of flux, and all stakeholders have an opportunity to use it to their maximum advantage. The Chilean women's movement, however, despite their mobilizing, did not meet the expectations of women as such. They did not demand institutional reforms for women and lost the chance to institutionalize gender quotas in the decision-making in Chile's transition from Pinochet's military regime. Hence, the Chilean women's movement could not succeed in gaining notable policy outcomes such as gender quotas in the Parliament or gender-specific legislation after the democratic transition. Chile's historical legacies and culture have always framed women as mothers and defenders of society's moral order. The Right conservative parties also chimed with the popular discourses and pushed women to their gender roles in the private sphere as soon as the democracy was restored. As a result, they had no job left for women when the strategic goal of regime transition was achieved. The alliances were timely and strategic and geared toward the greater goal than having any interest in institutionalizing women's rights post-transition. Henceforth, the Chilean women's movement could not sustain in post-transition and faded quickly. However, the women's movement's efforts demonstrate that it did not face a complete failure. The establishment of SERNAM is one of the

successes of the women's movement post-democratic transition of Chile from Pinochet's repressive regime.

It is also true that the adverse political context of Chile (Catholic Church, conservative political elite, and traditional/ cultural structures hampered women's movement capacity to fully utilize the opportunity into more meaningful gender outcomes. In other words, the dominant male political elite in the political arena pushed women back to resume their traditional roles because men returned to their public roles after Pinochet's rule was over. As Jenkins and Perrow put it, political context defines breathing space for social movements; hence, women's movement was denied that breathing space in Chile. It seems fair to say that the women's movement is not solely responsible for not successfully achieving gender outcomes; instead, political alliances and Latin American political context had played a crucial role in determining the movement's gendered outcomes. The women's movement tried to negotiate women's demands at the bargaining table since they made strong alliances with their counterparts but gained modest success.

The case of South Africa's women's movement during and after the democratic transition presents phenomenally successful concerning the gendered outcomes. The women's mobilizing has a long history in South Africa though eclipsed by a later emphasis on the anti-Apartheid movement. South African women's movement successfully used the transition to democracy for instituting women's rights. The rich historical and cultural context ameliorated the Apartheid regime's transition to democracy for women. They could negotiate women's interests to the top political elite and materialize them at the policy level. Facts show that South Africa's movement was organized self-consciously, whereas the political culture and context of South Africa provided a supporting ground for women to mobilize for collective action. One contributing factor to the women's movement's success was using culturally appropriate frames and symbols for their cause in the South African context. The South African women's movement, highly organized, successfully negotiated gender outcomes during the democratic transition and successfully gained substantive women representation of 30% in the legislative, bureaucratic, and constitutional arena. On a policy level, progressive legislation on abortion and domestic violence are visible gendered outcomes of the South African women's movement.

In Pakistan's context, the women's movement could mobilize women's groups and organizations, NGOs committed to women's rights, and human rights activists alongside women members of Parliament and gained 33% gender quotas at the local government level and 17% at the Parliament. Furthermore, the series of progressive pro-women legislation by the Parliament since 2002 to date can be viewed as the success of the women's movement and advocacy of civil society and the media. In Pakistan's political scenario, PPP and its experienced politicians have played a significant role in passing pro-women legislation during their government (2008-2012). However, patriarchal political culture and extremism, and Right conservative political parties are hazardous for the women's movement in Pakistan. Thus, progress is gradual and slow as compared to the South African women's movement. It is noteworthy that the secular and liberal political parties' role is also crucial to Pakistan's women's movement's performance.

Pakistani women's movement successfully presented women's long-time demands and issues to the democratic transition and gained favorable outcomes like gender quotas and women-friendly laws in the post-transition period. It is still striving for gender equality in the political arena post-democratic transition. Due to specific historical and cultural contexts, party alliances, and international influence, the women's movements show variation in achieving gendered outcomes transition politics. All three cases show a considerable variation in the gendered outcomes of the women's movements. The different historical, political, and cultural contexts played a vital role in the variation. Nevertheless, a striking resemblance between all three cases is that those authoritarian regimes were unyielding to crumble without women's mobilization and agitation. The same was exploited by the shrewd political parties to succeed.

Notes

[1] Huntington's conceptualizing.
[2] For Chile, 1980 -1989; South Africa, 1985 -1994, and Pakistan, 1999 -2008.
[3] The term is original, and commas are for emphasis.
[4] Servicio Nacional de la Mujer (SERNAM)- a national body to evaluate, coordinate and execute policies on women's issues.
[5] CEDAW – Eradication of All kinds of Discrimination Against Women.
[6] Sustainable Development Goals

[7] Millennium Development Goals

[8] WAF – Women Action Forum

[9] Women's organizations such as *ASAR*, women NGOs such as *Aurat* Foundation (AF), *Shirkat Gah,* women members of parliaments (MPs), and Gender Studies and Women studies centers (academics and activists) from public sector universities among others are associated with women's movement.

References

Alvarez, Sonia A. 1989. "Politicizing Gender and Engendering Democracy." In Democratizing Brazil: Problems of Transition and Consolidation, edited by Alfred Stepan, 206-251. Oxford University Press.

Baldez, Lisa. 2002. Why Women Protest? Women's Movement in Chile. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Beckwith, Karen. 2000. "Beyond compare? Women's movements in comparative perspective." European journal of political research 37, no. 4: 431-468.

Boldt, Kelly, and Timothy J. White. 2011. Chilean Women and Democratization: Entering Politics through Resistance as Arpilleristas. Vol. 24. 2 vols. Asian Journal of Latin American Studies.

Caivano, Joan M., and Thayer Hardwick. 2008. "Civil Society and Social Movements: Building sustainable democracies in Latin America." Latin American Women in Movement: Changing Politics, Changing Minds. No. 4. Edited by Arthur Domke. Inter-American Development Bank, January 11. 265-300.

Dryzek, John S. 1996. "Chapter 4: The Informal Logic of Institutional Design." In The Theory of Institutional Design, by Robert (eds) Goodin, 103-125. Cambridge University Press.

Franceschet, Susan. 2005. Women and politics in Chile. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Franceschet, Susan, and Laura Mcdonald. 2003. Hard Times for Citizenship: Women's Movement in Chile and Mexico. Canadian Political Science Association, May-June.

Goodin, Robert. 1996. "Chapter 1: Institutions and Their Design." In The Theory of Institutional Design, by Robert (ed.) Goodin, 1-43. Cambridge University Press.

Guo, Sujian, and Gary A. Stradiotto. 2014. Democratic transitions: Modes and outcomes. Routledge.

Guzman, Virginia, Ute Seibert, and Silke Staab. 2010. "Democracy in Country but not in the Home: Religion, politics and women's rights in Chile." The World Quarterly 31 (6): 971-988.

Hejnova, Petra. 2012. "Message from the State: Uncovering Effects from Public Policy on Women's Movement in Chile and the Czech Republic." Ph.D. Thesis, Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University.

Htun, Mala, and S. Laurel Weldon. 2012. "The civic origins of progressive policy change: Combating violence against women in the global perspective, 1975–2005." American Political Science Review: 548-569.

Huntington, Samuel P. 1991. The Third Wave. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press.

Inman, Robert P. 2013. "Understanding the Democratic Transition in South Africa." American Law and Economic Review 0 (0): 2-38.

Inter-Parliamentary Union. 2012. "Women in national parliaments." October 31. Accessed November 28, 2012. www.ipu.org/wmn-e/classif.html.

IPU. 2013. Women in national parliaments. November 1. Accessed November 30, 2013. www.ipu.org/wmn-e/classif.htm.

Jenkins, J. Craig, and Charles Perrow. 1977. "Insurgency of the Powerless: Farm Worker Movements (1946-1972)." American Sociological Review (American Sociological Association) 42 (2): 249-268.

Lawson, Stephanie. 1993. "Conceptual Issues in the Comparative Study of Regime Change and Democratization." Edited by City University. Comparative Politics 25.

Lenser, A. M. 2019. The South African Women's Movement: The Roles of Feminism and Multiracial Cooperation in the Struggle for Women's Rights. *Theses and Dissertations* Retrieved from https://scholarworks.uark.edu/etd/3397

Levitsky, Steven, and Lucan Way. 2002. "The Rise of Competitive Authoritarianism." Journal of Democracy (The Johns Hopkins University Press) 13 (2): 51-65.

Linz, Juan J., and Alfred Stepan. 1996. Problems of Democratic Transition and Consolidation. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Meintjes, Sheila. 2011. "The women's struggle for equality during South Africa's transition to democracy." Transformation, no. 75: 107+. Gale Academic OneFile (accessed February 5, 2021).

Przeworski, Adam. 1986. "Some Problems in the Study of the Transition to Democracy." In Transitions from Authoritarian Rule. Comparative Perspectives, vol. 3, ed. O'Donnell G., Philippe Schmitter, and Laurence Whitehead. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press: 47–64.

Smelser, Neil. 1962. "Theory of Collective Behavior." In Social Movements, by Vincenzo Ruggiero and Nicola Montagna (eds), 79-85. Routledge.

Schwindt-Bayer, Leslie. 2015. "Chile's Gender Quota: Will it Work?"

Seidman, Gay W. 1999. "Gendered citizenship: South Africa's democratic transition and the construction of a gendered state." Gender & Society 13, no. 3: 287-307.

Taylor, Verta. 1989. "Social Movements Continuity: The Women's Movement in Abeyance." American Sociological Review (American Sociological Association) 54 (5).

The Dawn Daily. 2011. Pro women bill: A landmark achievement. The Dawn Daily.

Tobar, Marcela Ríos. 2003. "Chilean Feminism (s) in the 1990s Paradoxes of an Unfinished Transition." International Feminist Journal of Politics 5, no. (2003): 256-280.

Toppin, Gabrielle. 2018. "Catholicism and Feminism: A Chilean Paradox." *Honors Theses.* 343. https://egrove.olemiss.edu/hon_thesis/343

UN WOMEN. Pro women laws take hold in Pakistan. March 26. Accessed November 28, 2012. www.unwomen.org.

Walsh, Denise M. 2012. "Does the quality of democracy matter for women's rights? Just debate and democratic transition in Chile and South Africa." Comparative political studies 45 (11): 1323-1350.

Waylen, Georgina. 2008. "Enhancing the Substantive Representation of Women: Lessons from Transitions to Democracy." Parliamentary Affairs (Oxford University Press).

Waylen, Georgina. 2010. "Gendering politics and policy in transition to democracy: Chile and Soth Africa." Policy and Politics (The Policy Press) 38 (3): 337-352.

—. 1994. "Women and Democratization: Conceptualizing Gender Relations in Transition Politics." Accessed 2 10, 2012. http://www.jstor.org/stable/2950685.

Waylen, Georgina. 2007. "Women's Mobilization and Gender Outcomes in Transitions to Democracy: The Case of South Africa." Comparative Political Studies (Sage Publications) 40 (5): 521-546.

Welsh, Helga A. 1994. "Political Transition Processes in Central and Eastern Europe." Comparative Politics 27 (July): 379–394.

Young, Iris Marion. 2002. Inclusion and democracy. Oxford University Press.